Benjamin Errickson¹

Professor Benowitz 4 May 2018

Withers-Olweiler Residence: 525 North Hanover Street; Elizabethtown, Pennsylvania



Abstract:

This stone Cape Cod style house was designed by the architect, G. Edwin Brumbaugh. A famous restoration architect, Brumbaugh specialized in historic Pennsylvania Dutch stone houses. He was responsible for the restoration of the Ephrata Cloister. The house was built in 1927 by William A. Withers, proprietor of the W. A. Shoe Company, also known as the W. A. shoes. The dormers on this house are exact replicas of the buildings in the Ephrata Cloister. Brumbaugh affected the approach to historic preservation in the Middle Atlantic States. His numerous lectures advocated historic restoration was a worthy pursuit for the architect, and he was instrumental in raising local support to retain and restore even small town landmarks.

Property Details:

The Withers' Residence is located at 525 North Hanover Street in Elizabethtown, Pennsylvania 17022 Lancaster County.² The property is on the South-East corner of the intersection of North Hanover Street and Spring Garden Street.³ The lot measures approximately 180 by 175 feet, containing a total area of about 31500 square feet or 0.72 acres.⁴ The one story, stone and wood dwelling faces South-West and is 3,181 square feet in size.⁵

Deed Search:

The current community of Elizabethtown is situated between the Conoy Creek and the Conwego Creek along the Susquehanna River. In 1534 French King Francis, I (1494-1547) colonized North America establishing New France with Jacques Cartier (1491-1557) as Viceroy in Quebec.⁶ As early as 1615 Étienne Brûlé (1592-

¹ Preliminary research conducted by Michael J. Derr-Haverlach.

² "LanCo View," Map, Lancaster County Geographic Information System, Accessed 7 May 2018, https://gis.co.lancaster.pa.us/mox6/public.cfm?action=mox6_view_interface&CFID=157287&CFTOKEN=b93577dc73e91a45-859FE20B-0B92-98D2-122EB12EBB7AB5F0.

³ Ibid.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Zillow.com, Accessed 7 May 2018, https://www.zillow.com/homes/for_sale/54225408_zpid/40.201887,-76.535139,40.116874,-76.682768_rect/12_zm/1_fr/.

⁶ Robert Jean Knecht, Francis I (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1935), 333-343.

1633) explored the Susquehanna River and its tributaries in Lancaster County. Pennsylvania was claimed by Sweden in 1638 and then by the Dutch in 1655. The British claimed the former Dutch holdings in 1674. British King Charles, II (1630-1685) granted William Penn (1644-1718) the Province of Pennsylvania in 1681. The French and British disputed control of Pennsylvania between 1688-1763. During this time in 1707 French fur trader Peter Bezaillion (1662-1742) established a settlement between the Conoy and Conwego Creeks along the Susquehanna River. In 1719 Peter Bezaillion invited the Piscataway Indians to move from Maryland and settle with him along the Conoy Creek and Susquehanna River. Captain Thomas Harris (1695-1801) settled in Pennsylvania in 1726. In 1730, he built a log cabin along the Conoy Creek and in 1741 he legally received the warrant to the land. Then, in 1745 he built the Sign of the Bear Tavern, which was the first permanent structure in Elizabethtown.

Deeds to the property date all the way back to Samuel Hughes, who possessed the lot from 17 August 1785, however it is not known when he exactly sold the land. The chain of ownership since includes Joseph Martin (????? – 13 December 1847), ¹⁵ David Martin (13 December 1847 – 16 January 1865), ¹⁶ Aaron Martin (16 January 1865 – 1 April 1915), ¹⁷ Frank W. Groff (1 April 1915 – 18 August 1926), ¹⁸ William A. Withers (19 August 1926 – 1 October 1940), ¹⁹ Russel L. Hein (1 October 1940 – 4 April 1983), ²⁰ C. Ray Olweiler (4 April 1983 – 31 October 2005), ²¹ Phillip J. Longnecker (31 October 2005 – 29 December 2010), ²² Carol L. Donague (29 December 2010 – 24 June 2015), ²³ and most recently David. Haggerty. ²⁴

Architectural Style:

This house was built in 1927 by architect George Edwin Brumbaugh for William A. Withers. Brumbaugh was a famous restoration architect who specialized in stone houses tied into local Pennsylvania Dutch culture.²⁵ Brumbaugh was a native Pennsylvanian, and his parents were of German descent.²⁶ He was responsible for the restoration of the Ephrata Cloister and several other older Pennsylvania German stone houses.²⁷ Although, the

⁷ Consul Willshire Butterfield, <u>History of Brulé's Discoveries and Explorations</u>, 1610-1626 Being a Narrative of the Discover by Stephen Brulé of Lakes Huron, Ontario and Superior, and of his Explorations of Pennsylvania and western New York: Also of the Province of Ontario (Cleveland, OH: Herman-Taylor, 1898), 49-51.

⁸ Randall M. Miller, ed., <u>Pennsylvania</u>: A <u>History of the Commonwealth</u> (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press and the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, 2002), 50-60.

⁹ Jean R. Soderlund, <u>William Penn and the Founding of Pennsylvania</u>, 1680-1684: A <u>Documentary History</u> (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press and the Historical Society of Pennsylvania, 1983), 39-50.

¹⁰ Henry Meclchior Muhlenberg Richards, <u>The Pennsylvania-Germans in the French and Indian War: A Historical Sketch Prepared at</u> the Request of the Pennsylvania-German Society (Lancaster: The Pennsylvania German Society, 1905), 16-22.

¹¹ David L. Martin, <u>A Clash of Cultures: Native Americans and Colonialism in Lancaster County, Pennsylvania</u> (Morgan, PA: Masthof Press, 2010), 21-23.

¹² Ibid.

¹³ Richard K. MacMaster, <u>Elizabethtown: The First Three Centuries</u> (Elizabethtown, PA: Elizabethtown Historical Society, 1999), 5. ¹⁴ Ibid, 8.

¹⁵ Lancaster County Recorder of Deeds, Search Online Records, Infodex, Document, Book G, Volume 9, Page 398, accessed 8 May 2018, https://www.searchiqs.com/palan/InfodexMainMP.aspx.

¹⁶ Ibid.

¹⁷ Book H, Volume 22, Page 152.

¹⁸ Book G, Volume 28, Page 549.

¹⁹ Book P, Volume 33, Page 153.

²⁰ Lancaster County Recorder of Deeds, Search Public Records, Instrument Number 5001309783, accessed July 3, 2018, https://searchdocs.lancasterdeeds.com/countyweb/disclaimer.do.

²¹ Instrument Number 3056248.

²² Instrument Number 5904776.

²³ Instrument Number 6215468.

²⁴ Ibid.

²⁵ Emily Lynn Wolf, "Architecture Tells the Story: G. Edwin Brumbaugh and His Contributions to the Field of Restoration Architecture" (2008), *Theses (Historic Preservation)*, 117, 2.

²⁶ Ibid.

²⁷ Ibid.

Wither's Residence was substantially larger than a typical Pennsylvania German stone house, and is somewhat of a mansion compared to typical structures. Nevertheless, the Wither's Residence is typical of Brumbaugh's style due to the careful research in which Brumbaugh did before any project to ensure the house fit into the local aesthetic. The stone and lumber for the house were almost certainly locally sourced, and the incorporation of Brethren meeting house aesthetics, particularly keeping the building to a single story, was most likely done deliberately by Brumbaugh after researching the local area. 29

After Phillip J. Longnecker purchased the house in 2005, he had the inside renovated and the landscaping redone to his satisfaction. These modifications were mostly cosmetic, and care was taken to incorporate as much of the existing structure as possible into the new design. The largest interior changes involved the almost total overhaul of the electrical wiring to bring the building up to code and allow for twenty first century luxuries including flat screen TVs and wireless internet. The most drastic changes were made to the landscaping around the house, which included leveling the area and constructing stone pathways. A fountain, fire pit, and hot tub were also added to complement the pool.

Cape Cod architecture derived from the early settlers of England in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries and replicated a cottage style look which was very appealing to many generations of Americans. This college styles comes from the thatched cottages which can be seen throughout Britain and purpose of this style is to resist harshest periods of winter. Over a few generations, popularity with the Cape Cod rose. Reverend Timothy Dwight who was the eighth president of Yale University in Connecticut who served from 1795 to 1817, recognized these style of houses as he was traveling along the Massachusetts coastline. He wrote in a book, around the year 1800, to describe his travels and with this, he explained the style of these houses as "Cape Cod" thus creating the term as it is now in present architecture. ³⁵

The Architectural style for the building addressed 525 Hanover Street has been established to be a Cape Cod based structure. One particular eye catching detail seen on this structure is the two gabled dormers located on the front façade of the building. Although, this detail is not related to Cape Cod architecture but speculated to be related to Pennsylvania German Tradition architecture seen in the Ephrata Cloister. Going back to Cape Cod architecture, 525 Hanover Street has a Chimney located at gable end on the left side of the house and chimney within Cape Cod architecture represent the heart or center of the house. Several other architectural features present on this structure in which derive from Cape Cod architecture is the shutters on the first level, the structure is 1½ stories, and the steep roof with a side gable.

Historical Context and Purpose:

Samuel Hughes was the second son of Barney Hughes. At age twenty, Samuel acquired half of his late father's iron furnace in Washington County, Maryland. Under his management, the iron works made a small profit. Hughes was also a delegate to the Maryland Convention in 1776, a member of the House of Delegates in

²⁸ Ibid.

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ Sue Long, "Small Town Living... Where Everybody Knows Your House," Lancaster County, October 2007, 61-75.

³¹ Ibid.

³² Ibid.

³³ Ibid.

³⁴ Ibid.

³⁵ "Colonial Revival: The Cape Cod." Cape Cod Style Homes. Accessed July 09, 2018. http://www.antiquehome.org/Architectural-Style/cape-cod.htm.

³⁶ "Pushing William Penn's "Holy Experiment" to Its Limits: Ephrata Cloister | PHMC History Pennsylvania Heritage Magazine Current & Past Issues 1996 Fall." PHMC Pennsylvania Architectural Field Guide. Accessed July 09, 2018. http://www.phmc.state.pa.us/portal/communities/pa-heritage/william-penn-holy-experiment-ephrata-cloister.html.

³⁷ Carol Cragoe, <u>How to Read Buildings: A Crash Course in Architectural Styles</u>. (NY: Rizzoli International Publications Inc., 2008), 226.

^{38 &}quot;Colonial Revival: The Cape Cod."

1777-1779, and a state senator in 1781-1790. Hughes used his iron works to cast cannons for Congress. The profits he received from the cannon works allowed him to pay off his company's British investors with interest. The money also enabled him buy out his brothers' share of their father's Pennsylvania real estate. ³⁹ In July 1786 Daniel, John, and Barnabas Hughes sold two tracts of land in Donegal and Mount Joy Township to Samuel for 1,500 pounds. The land included the 252- acre tract on which the Bear Tavern and the town of Elizabethtown stood, and an adjacent 145 acres. 40 On March 29, 1787, Hughes deeded Elizabethtown Lot 16 to Jacob Towenberger, William Hog (Haag), Jacob Shaver (Sheaffer), and Peter Shaver (Sheaffer), Elders of the Lutheran Church of Mount Joy Township. It is claimed the Church now stands on this lot.⁴¹ In 1790, Hughes began to sell Elizabethtown lots as freeholds. This gave purchasers of the lots a clear title to the properties. Peter Shaeffer, Conrad Mayer, Christopher Gamelin, Frederick Byroad, Andrew Gross, John Roetting, Rosanna Jamison, and Philip Albert were all executed deeds by Hughes in April 1790. Fifteen pounds was the standard down payment for lots in Elizabethtown, but these deeds said nothing about an annual ground rent. 42 Hughes made additional sales of Elizabethtown lots in October 1790. These lots were purchased by Conrad Gross, Peter Bishop, Conrad Meyer, Andrew Gross, and Peter Shaeffer. Hughes also sold the Bear Tayern and the remaining tract bordering Elizabethtown on the northwest as far as High Street to Alexander Boggs of Donegal Township. On October 28, 1790. Hughes sold 230 acres to Boggs for 1,500 pounds. Within the same month, Hughes sold a 145 acres' tract to John Black, Jr. and a 209 acres' tract patented in his own name in four unequal lots. The last of Hughes' land to be sold was a 139 acres' tract in Mount Joy Township. It was bought by Leonard Negely. This tract bordered on land belonging to John Black and David Chambers, and therefore, Hughes disposed of all his land in Donegal and Mount Joy Townships surrounding Elizabethtown on the west, northeast, and east. 43 In June 1791, Hughes signed another series of deeds for lots. These deeds included the one for Lot 1, sold to John Coffman, Andrew Gross, and Henry Eakinroad, and the one for Lot 5, sold to Peter Sheaffer. In April 1792, Hughes and his wife executed a final set of deeds for town lots. Pennsylvania law made the recordings of signed deeds optional. Therefore, many other deeds signed over by Hughes were never recorded in Lancaster County Court House.⁴⁴

In March 1895, David H. Martin opened his clothing store at 1 Center Square. The location was once home to a grocery store. Unfortunately, the building burned in 1892. Martin bought the building and opened his own business. ⁴⁵⁴⁶ The David H. Martin store sold men's and boy's ready-made and made to order clothing, shoes, and furnishings. ⁴⁷ As the business grew, the store expanded into the adjacent building--where the *Chronicle* office was later located. Eventually, the David H. Martin store relocated to a building on the opposite corner of Center Square. In 1911, the store moved to a property along South Market Street. It was here in which the store remained for over eighty years. David Martin eventually passed down the store to his son Walter S. Martin. ⁴⁸ In addition to David H. Martin's legacy of his clothing store, Martin was also instrumental, alongside Rev. Paul W. McBeth, in bringing Christian Light Bookstore to Elizabethtown in 1942. ⁴⁹

Aaron Martin was cashier of the First National Bank of Elizabethtown from 1905 and minister in the local Church of the Brethren in Christ.⁵⁰ In 1929, Frank W. Groff served as a director for the First National Bank &

³⁹ MacMaster, 47.

⁴⁰ Ibid., 48.

⁴¹ Ibid., 45.

⁴² Ibid., 48.

⁴³ Ibid., 49.

⁴⁴ Ibid., 50.

⁴⁵ Ibid., 119.

⁴⁶ Ibid., 188.

⁴⁷ Ibid., 189.

⁴⁸ Ibid., 135. ⁴⁹ Ibid.264.

⁵⁰ Ibid., 203.

Trust Company in Elizabethtown, PA.⁵¹ After his death, his wife and widow at the time, Mrs. Mary A. Groff laid out Sunnyside Heights in July of 1941.⁵²

In 1891, William A. Withers married Anna L. Eby and worked as a clerk for her father's general store in Bachmanville, Dauphin County. In 1899, Withers began to work for A.S. Kreider in the Annville factory as a shoe cutter for one dollar a week. In 1901, with the help of his father-in-law H.B. Eby, Withers bought a onesixth interest in Kreider's factory in Elizabethtown. The opportunity presented itself when Kreider needed capital to start the business. With this investment, Withers and his family moved to Elizabethtown. He served as a member of the board of directors for the Kreider Shoe Manufacturing Company and oversaw the cutting and fitting department. In 1902 when he became plant manager. He remained plant superintendent until 1918 when Withers decided to leave the Kreider factory and establish the W.A. Withers Shoe Company (W.A.W. Shoes), a retail distributor of A.S. Kreider shoes. W.A.W. Shoes initially sold Kreider shoes exclusively by mail order. Later, the company expanded into a chain of stores. Withers bought numerous properties for the expansion, including the Elizabethtown Market House on South Poplar Street. The house was bought in 1920 and became the company's headquarters. In 1922, W.A.W. Shoes began manufacturing baby shoes. The company produced 1,000 pairs a day at their headquarters. This was not direct competition for A.S. Kreider. Wither's company remained a subsidiary of the Kreider company until 1923. Once connections between the two companies were completely severed, Withers began expanding the company's manufacturing capabilities to include a line of children's shoes. William A. Withers retired from the business in 1926.⁵³

At age four, Russel L. Hein's father passed away, leaving his mother to raise Russel and his three siblings. Under these circumstances, Hein and his siblings learned how to work at an early age. Hein took his first job at 12 years old, delivering mild before attending school every morning. While in high school, he worked during summer vacation at the A.S. Kreider Shoe Company. He eventually went on to work in the shipping department at the Lancaster Shoe Company. Hein stayed with the company for fifteen years. He spent time in charge of the packing and shipping department and gained experience in the credit and sales department. In 1934, Hein became confident in his knowledge of the shoe industry and opened his own shoe store in Elizabethtown at 39 West High Street. In later years, Hein went on to serving as director for the Elizabethtown Trust Company. He also served on the County Ration Board, and he was elected director of the Farmer's Mutual Insurance Company. ⁵⁴

⁵¹ pp. 5, *Elizabethtown Chronicle*, Saturday, June 22, 1929.

⁵² MacMaster, 239.

⁵³ Ibid., 171.

⁵⁴ "Economy Shoes2" Winters Heritage House.

Appendix Historical Photos:



Appendix Current Photos:

